

Filed Under Seal

Exhibit G

Message

From: Loredana Crisan [/O=THEFACEBOOK/OU=EXTERNAL (FYDIBOHF25SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN= [REDACTED]]
Sent: 2/13/2020 5:49:36 PM
To: Adam Mosseri [REDACTED]@fb.com]
Subject: FW: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

From: Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>
Date: Wednesday, November 13, 2019 at 5:26 PM
To: John Hegeman <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, Ficus Kirkpatrick <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, Luke Woods <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Vishal Shah <[REDACTED]@fb.com>
Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, Loredana Crisan <[REDACTED]@fb.com>
Subject: Re: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

Hi John,

The team put together a one(-ish) pager on the academic research and external engagement that was conducted before forming the policy recommendation. I think it outlines some compelling motivations for formalizing these policies.

https://docs.google.com/document/d/1JYY60GeffqAAg_ZkQ61GcAHXsfIBDr2koliFZPT1v_w/edit#

These restrictions on plastic surgery effects have been informally in place for a long time so I am a bit surprised to hear the push back. When we last talked, all teams were in support of these guidelines. Is there something specific about the wording that causes concern? Or do you feel these are different than what we discussed in the past?

WRT the sticky setting, we noted in the email that this was something we needed to discuss as there is not yet alignment on this issue. The outstanding concern in my mind which we've discussed is whether making the effects sticky after a single use was a strong enough signal of user preference.

Thanks,
 Margaret

Margaret Gould Stewart
 VP of Product Design
 Facebook, Inc

From: John Hegeman <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Sent: Wednesday, November 13, 2019 3:14 AM

To: Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Ficus Kirkpatrick <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Luke Woods <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Vishal Shah <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Loredana Crisan <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Subject: Re: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

I'd also love to go deeper on our understanding of the harm and where we are relative to the broader market and cultural norms across the world. In general I worry that our approach to these policies is too US-centric and also doesn't put enough emphasis on giving people the power to represent themselves in the way that they would like.

On the specific suggestions:

1. **Plastic Surgery:** I think a blanket ban on things that can't be done with make-up is going to limit our ability to be competitive in Asian markets (including India). I'd much rather see us develop a more nuanced framework for responsible use that still allows us to build the products that people clearly want and intentionally seek out.
2. **Default On/Sticky Settings:** Similar to our last discussion I'm supportive of not making these effects default on but I don't think we should have a blanket ban on sticky settings provided that it is clear when they are being applied. The concept of "sticky settings" also seems a little obscure so would be a little surprised if we actually get a lot of credit for committing to this.

From: Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Date: Tuesday, November 12, 2019 at 9:01 PM

To: Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Ficus Kirkpatrick <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Luke Woods <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Vishal Shah <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; John Hegeman <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Loredana Crisan <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Subject: Re: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

Adding Vishal and [REDACTED] as I'm on the road.

From: Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Date: Wednesday, November 13, 2019 at 8:55 AM

To: Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Ficus Kirkpatrick <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>

Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; John Hegeman <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Loredana Crisan <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Subject: Re: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

Just FYI I mentioned this to Mark and he might want to review before implementing. He is concerned about whether we have good enough data that this represents real harm

Boz

From: Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>
Date: Tuesday, November 12, 2019 at 3:53 PM
To: [REDACTED]@fb.com>, Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, Ficus Kirkpatrick <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>
Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, John Hegeman <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Loredana Crisan <[REDACTED]@fb.com>
Subject: Re: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

+ Loredana

From: [REDACTED]@fb.com>
Date: Wednesday, November 13, 2019 at 7:44 AM
To: Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, Ficus Kirkpatrick <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>
Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, John Hegeman <[REDACTED]@fb.com>
Subject: RE: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

Hey Margaret, great timing then! @ [REDACTED] could you loop Margaret into your upcoming meeting? Thank you!

From: Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2019 3:42 PM
To: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Ficus Kirkpatrick <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com> [REDACTED]
Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; John Hegeman <[REDACTED]@fb.com>
Subject: Re: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

Hey [REDACTED] would be great to participate in the discussion about default/stick settings since this is something the FB app team is also looking at.

Get [Outlook for iOS](#)

From: [REDACTED]@fb.com>

Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2019 3:40:29 PM

To: Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>; [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Ficus Kirkpatrick <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; John Hegeman <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Subject: RE: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

Thank you *Margaret*! ☺

From: Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2019 3:39 PM

To: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>; [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Ficus Kirkpatrick <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; John Hegeman <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Subject: Re: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

Margaret is driving this, not me :)

From: [REDACTED]@fb.com>

Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2019 3:38:16 PM

To: Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>; [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Ficus Kirkpatrick <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; John Hegeman <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Subject: RE: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

+ [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] for Spark AR

Thanks for the update Fidji. Spark AR is fully supportive of the policy around plastic surgery effects. Meanwhile, @ [REDACTED] PM Lead for Spark AR, already has time scheduled to discuss default-on/sticky settings.

From: Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2019 2:48 PM

To: Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>; [REDACTED] <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Ficus Kirkpatrick <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; John Hegeman <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Subject: Re: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

Adding John for Blue

From: Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2019 2:43:15 PM

To: Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>; Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; Ficus Kirkpatrick <ficus@fb.com>

Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>; [REDACTED]@fb.com>

Subject: Re: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

+ [REDACTED] for SparkAR

Boz

From: Margaret Stewart <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Date: Tuesday, November 12, 2019 at 1:56 PM

To: Fidji Simo <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Adam Mosseri <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Stan Chudnovsky <[REDACTED]@fb.com>, Will Cathcart <[REDACTED]@whatsapp.com>, Andrew Bosworth <[REDACTED]@fb.com>

Cc: [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>, [REDACTED]@fb.com>

Subject: [Feedback needed] Plastic Surgery AR Effects + Camera Settings Policies

Hi Fidji, Adam, Stan, Will & Boz,

As a continuation of our previous conversations on the topic of camera effects, wanted to bring your attention to some policy updates that are going to be brought to Product Policy Forum. Please feel free to loop members of your teams in as needed.

Ask: We are asking for your support to update our policies to:

1. Disallow effects that mimic plastic surgery for first party (FB/IG/MSGR) and third party effects.
2. Disallow default-on settings, including sticky settings, for camera effects and filters (*to be discussed further, see next steps*)

Products Impacted: Instagram, Spark AR, Messenger, Facebook, WhatsApp

Next Steps:

- **Disallowing Plastic Surgery in Effects (Nov. 19):** The policy recommendation for effects that mimic plastic surgery will be presented at the Nov. 19th Product Policy Forum (PPF) for final feedback from Content Policy leadership (Monika Bickert), so any feedback would need to be captured beforehand. Content Policy is happy to present to you or your team before this if you want to discuss. You are also welcome to join that forum.
- **Disallow Default-on/Sticky Settings (Fast-follow):** We want to discuss this with you and your teams to have internal alignment on this approach. The first party settings policy recommendation will be passed once we have final input from you and your teams.

Additional background and policy details below.

Google has recently reached out to us to discuss collaborating on "over beautification" of selfie cameras. We're setting up an initial meeting with them soon (date tbd), so we'd like to have our policy position on settings and plastic surgery within effects locked down prior to this meeting. More info on this below.

Best,

Margaret, [REDACTED]

Background:

PR Fire on Plastic Surgery: In mid-October 2019, there was a PR fire about third party effects that stated Instagram was allowing the promotion of plastic surgery. The concern by press and mental health experts were on the impact that those effects were having on mental health and wellbeing, especially for more vulnerable users (youth, women). This resulted in a set of interim guidelines banning plastic surgery effects and moving the Effects Gallery to whitelist only. These guidelines were received extremely well by the press, though many of the creators of these effects lamented this policy and its impact on their scope. We are now working to resolve this interim state and finalize our guidelines for creators and our external narrative.

Google Outreach: Google reached out to us in September 2019 to collaborate on addressing "over-beautification". For Android R (launching in May 2020), one of the areas that the Android team wants to help address is "over-beautification" of selfie camera. One of their main initiatives is called "Consented Beautification" – meaning they want any beautification on Android to be done with user consent. We are still investigating what this means in practice wrt default and sticky settings. Google is talking to equipment manufacturers for native cameras and various developers to understand how to solve this issue together. Having a buy-in from big developers like FB would help push this effort forward.

Policy Recommendations:

1. Third + First Party Policy on Beauty Effects:

Issue: We're seeing a rise in popularity of beauty effects — both in creation and in use — which has reinvigorated the conversation on the stance that Facebook, Instagram, Oculus, etc. should take on how those filters relate to body image, mental health, and wellbeing. This is especially sensitive for its potential impact on our younger users, who are the biggest demographic using our Spark effects. You can see some example effects [here](#).

Policy recommendation: *Reject cosmetic effects that change the user's facial structure in a way that cannot be achieved by makeup and must be achieved by plastic surgery. This excludes fantastical effects that change a user's facial structure for the purpose of turning the user into a character or animal.*

Note:

- *This excludes effects that give the user makeup, as long as they are not coupled with facial distortion.*
- *Skin smoothing is permitted.*
- *We do not refer to any editorial camera effects or filters as "beauty" or "beautification" effects or filters.*

Policies that are already live

- *No effects that explicitly promote plastic surgery (e.g. nip/tuck lines on the face)*
- *No negative stereotypes are allowed to be depicted in effects (e.g. blackface)*
- *Effects that lighten the user's skin for the purpose of making their skin tone seem lighter is already not allowed. Entire image luminescence in the case of a colored filter (either pre-capture or post-capture) is permitted.*

PPF:

On November 19th, this issue is being brought to the Product Policy Forum for a decision. For the past few months (and predating the PR escalation that happened in October), a cross-functional working group composed of members of the Spark AR and IG product teams, product and public policy teams, AR/VR and IG comms teams, legal, ops, research, etc. has worked on this issue. This has included extensive research gathering and outreach to external stakeholders.

Research and external outreach has largely unanimously pointed us towards the recommendation below.

2. First Party Camera Settings Policies

Issue: As an extension of our approach to authentic identity, we want people who use our platform and creative tools to know Facebook thinks they look fine just the way they are. We also want to provide people with creative tools to adjust their captures to help them be more comfortable with sharing, and to provide a creative outlet for expression and sharing with our fantastical masks and filters.

Policy Recommendations:

1. Default Settings

All camera product features should be opt-in and NOT default-on. This ensures that the null state of what someone sees is as close to natural as possible before they engage with an effect for the first time

The only accepted default modifications are limited to the correction of distortion produced by camera lenses native to the device.

2. Sticky Settings

Settings cannot be sticky for camera effects and filters. Users need to explicitly opt-in to using a filter each time they use the camera.

Appendix:

Detailed Policies

FB Inc: Guidelines for Camera Art and Product Features:

<https://docs.google.com/document/d/1r0ZUYpxlnWlx7RkxQy7kLyUfa8Afa5FfEhg30NfZdas/edit#>

Spark AR Internal Policies:

https://docs.google.com/document/d/13mCKmKXG_xBebN0Jr6wL7PIFTa0x9UYHsuUkYAzhjXY/edit#

Margaret Gould Stewart

VP of Product Design
Facebook, Inc