

AMENDED Exhibit 714

PLAINTIFFS' OMNIBUS OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS' MOTIONS FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT

Case No.: 4:22-md-03047-YGR

MDL No. 3047

In Re: Social Media Adolescent Addiction/Personal Injury Products Liability Litigation

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 1

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

IN RE: SOCIAL MEDIA Case No. 4:22-MD-03047-
ADOLESCENT ADDICTION/ YGR MDL No. 3047
PERSONAL INJURY PRODUCTS
LIABILITY LITIGATION MDL No. 3047

This Document Relates to:
ALL ACTIONS

30(B)(1)/PMQ FOR GOOGLE/YOU TUBE
VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF
ALICE WU PAULUS
CONFIDENTIAL PURSUANT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER
Wednesday, January 29, 2025
PALO ALTO, CALIFORNIA

Reported By:

KATHLEEN A. MALTBIE, STENOGRAPHIC REPORTER
California CSR 10068, Nevada CCR 995, Texas CSR
12212, RPR-RMR-CRR-CCRR-CLR-CRC-RDR

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 2

VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF ALICE WU PAULUS

BE IT REMEMBERED that on Wednesday,
January 29, 2025, commencing at the hour of
9:17 a.m. thereof, before me, Kathleen A. Maltbie,
RPR-RMR-CRR-CCRR-CLR-CRC-RDR, a Certified
Stenographic Shorthand Reporter, in and for the
State of California, Nevada and Texas, personally
appeared ALICE WU PAULUS, a witness in the
above-entitled court and cause, who, being by me
first duly sworn, was thereupon examined as a
witness in said action.

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 3

1 APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL

2 FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:

3 SIMMONS HANLY CONROY
4 112 Madison Avenue, 7th Floor
New York, New York 10016-7416
BY: AN TRUONG, ESQ.
5 ELLYN HURD, ESQ.
Telephone: (212) 257-8482
6 Email: Atruong@simmonsfirm.com
ehurd@simmonsfirm.com

7
8 FOR THE DEFENDANTS GOOGLE/YOUTUBE:

9 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH &
ROSATI
10 1301 Avenue of the Americas
40th Floor
New York, NY 10019-6022
11 BY: BRIAN M. WILLEN, ESQ.
PRAATIKA PRASAD, ESQ.
12 Telephone: (650) 565-3641
Email: Bwillen@wsgr.com
13 pprasad@wsgr.com

14 And

15 WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP
680 Maine Avenue SW
16 Washington, DC 20024
BY: ASHLEY W. HARDIN, ESQ.
17 Telephone: 202-434-5960
Email: Ahardin@wc.com

18 COUNSEL APPEARING VIA ZOOM

19 FOR THE DEFENDANTS GOOGLE/YOUTUBE:

20 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH &
21 ROSATI
953 East Third Street, Suite 100
22 Los Angeles, California 90013
BY: CALLIE DAVIDSON, ESQ.
23 Telephone: (323) 210-2900
Email: Cdavidson@wsgr.com

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 4

1 APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL (Continued)
2 FOR THE DEFENDANTS GOOGLE/YOUTUBE:

3 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH &
4 ROSATI
5 701 Fifth Avenue, Suite 5100
6 Seattle, Washington 98104-7036
7 BY: MCKINNEY WHEELER, ESQ.
8 Telephone: (206) 883-2684
9 Email: Mckinney.wheeler@wsgr.com

10 FOR THE META DEFENDANTS:

11 SHOOK HARDY BACON
12 JPMorgan Chase Tower
13 600 Travis Street, Suite 3400
14 Houston, Texas 77002
15 BY: HUNTER K. AHERN, ESQ.
16 Telephone: (206) 344.7620
17 Email: Hahern@shb.com

18 And

19 SHOOK HARDY BACON
20 The Plaza In Clayton
21 190 Carondelet Plaza, Suite 1350
22 St. Louis, Missouri 63105
23 BY: CHELSEA M. MANNERY, ESQ.
24 Telephone: (314) 6900-0208
25 Email: Cmannery@shb.com

FOR THE TIKTOK DEFENDANTS:

GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP
310 University Avenue
Palo Alto, California 94301-1744
BY: KEVIN J. WHITE, ESQ.
Telephone: (650) 849-5358
Email: Kwhite@gibsondunn.com

FOR THE DEFENDANT SNAP, INC.:

MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP
601 Massachusetts Avenue NW, Suite 500 E
Washington, D.C. 20001
BY: LYNDESEY N. FRANKLIN, ESQ.
Telephone: (202) 220-1109
Email: Lyndsey.Franklin@mto.com

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 5

APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL (Continued)

ALSO PRESENT:

Alejandro Zamora Ruiz, Videographer

Lance Hoepfner, Exhibit tech

Raven Norris, in-house counsel, YouTube/Google
(Via Zoom Videoconference)

Marissa Urban, YouTube, Product Counsel,
Responsibility/Kids & Privacy

Reilly Dunne

Lauren White

Faith Lewis

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 26

1 A. No. Except for my husband.

2 Q. Okay. Fair enough.

3 MS. TRUONG: I'll go ahead and mark as
4 Exhibit 3 to this deposition. This is a document
5 that was provided to us yesterday from your counsel.
6 And it's represented to be your current curriculum
7 vitae.

8 (Whereupon, Deposition Exhibit 3
9 was marked for identification.)

10 MS. TRUONG: And for the record, the Bates
11 Number is -05713724.

12 BY MS. TRUONG:

13 Q. Ms. Wu, do you recognize this document?

14 A. Yes. It's my LinkedIn profile.

15 Q. Did you author the contents of this
16 profile?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Does it accurately reflect your
19 educational background and work experience?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. If we can just turn to the last page.
22 Let's start chronologically at the beginning.

23 It says you graduated from UC Berkeley in
24 2001; is that correct?

25 A. Correct.

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 27

1 Q. Okay. And then you started at Google in
2 February of 2006; is that correct?

3 A. Yes.

4 Q. Were you working anywhere from 2001 to
5 2006?

6 A. Yes. I was actually a -- a legal
7 assistant in law firms.

8 Q. Okay. Do you have a law degree?

9 A. No.

10 Q. All right. So in February of 2006, you
11 started at Google as a senior strategist, legal
12 consumer products; is that right?

13 A. Correct.

14 Q. And honing in on this legal description,
15 were you providing any legal advice at that time?

16 A. No. I -- I was on the legal operations
17 team.

18 Q. Legal operations team.
19 Were you working with other attorneys?

20 A. I was working with a product counsel
21 group.

22 Q. And who was your supervisor in that role?

23 A. [REDACTED].

24 Q. Can you spell that last name?

25 A. [REDACTED].

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 28

1 Q. Okay. And what types of issues were you
2 handling in this role?

3 A. I supported several different consumer
4 products, and my day-to-day was processing copyright
5 DMC complaints. That was a large -- large part of
6 the work volume. Handling some defamation
7 complaints, and then also reporting CCM detected on
8 our products.

9 Q. Okay. When you say "consumer products,"
10 what products were you working on?

11 A. It was Google photos at the time, the DMC
12 complaints, supporting web search blogger, Google's
13 blogger platform. Those were the main three.

14 Q. Okay. And then towards the end here in
15 the last sentence, it says (as read):

16 You created and project
17 managed the early iterations of
18 Google's transparency report before
19 the company published these
20 externally.

21 Do you see that?

22 A. Yes.

23 Q. What is Google's transparency report?

24 A. It is an annual -- now it is an annual
25 report, both Google and YouTube issues it, where we

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 29

1 share out our removal volumes across a range of --
2 whether it's legal or content enforcement issues
3 that we remove from our products on a quarterly
4 basis.

5 Q. And when you say it's an annual report
6 from Google and YouTube, is it Google and YouTube
7 have separate reports or they're all combined in
8 one?

9 A. Google and YouTube have separate reports,
10 but at -- in that role, I was working on just Google
11 products.

12 Q. Okay. And you said that the annual report
13 is a report regarding removal volumes --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- is that correct?

16 And you said regarding Google's legal
17 based and content based.

18 Am I understanding that --

19 A. Correct. Correct. Actually, I need to
20 correct. I don't believe it's an annual report, I
21 think it's quarterly.

22 Q. Okay. Quarterly or biquarterly. I forget
23 the cadence.

24 (Reporter clarification.)

25 MR. WILLEN: It's important to have a

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 30

1 clean transcript.

2 MS. TRUONG: I'll do that too. I think
3 I've been talking over people as well.

4 BY MS. TRUONG:

5 Q. And what -- what is the purpose of the
6 Google transparency report, as you understand it?

7 A. It's just to be more transparent with
8 external community on what we find and remove that
9 violates our policies.

10 Q. By "external community," do you mean the
11 public?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. Does the Google transparency report
14 publish any safety issues?

15 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

16 THE WITNESS: I -- when I worked on the
17 transparency report at Google during this period, we
18 were just reporting legal removals. I don't know
19 what the Google transparency reports on today.

20 BY MS. TRUONG:

21 Q. And when you created this project, was it
22 your position that it was important for a company
23 like Google to be transparent to the public about
24 what was happening?

25 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 31

1 THE WITNESS: When I created this project,
2 during my time on the legal team, it was just an
3 internal report.

4 BY MS. TRUONG:

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. That was distributed within the legal team
7 and the products that we supported.

8 Q. Okay. And when it became a public report,
9 were you supportive of that change?

10 A. Yes.

11 Q. Okay. And is that because you think that
12 the public should be aware of safety issues that
13 were happening at Google?

14 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

15 THE WITNESS: Sure. Yes.

16 BY MS. TRUONG:

17 Q. Okay. And during the time you were
18 working here, I know you put at the top, "Google."

19 Did you -- what's the distinction here
20 between when you say you're working at Google versus
21 YouTube?

22 A. So at the time when I was working here,
23 Google hadn't acquired YouTube yet.

24 Q. Okay.

25 A. Google acquired YouTube, I want to say, in

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 32

1 2008. And so soon after that acquisition, I moved
2 to YouTube. That's the next -- that's the next role
3 on my -- on my profile. So after YouTube was
4 acquired, then I moved to YouTube to -- to join
5 their team.

6 Q. Okay. And that was in August of 2009; is
7 that right?

8 A. Correct.

9 Q. And this role that you have listed, senior
10 manager, Trust & Safety - YouTube Ads Monetization,
11 was that the role that you transitioned into in
12 August of 2009?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Okay. And what prompted this change?

15 A. I mean, YouTube is a cool product, and
16 someone -- someone I worked with at Google in my
17 role there had moved to YouTube and she reached out.
18 She was the manager of this team, and she reached
19 out to me about an opportunity, and so I joined --

20 Q. Okay.

21 A. -- her team.

22 Q. And did you have any say in what team you
23 joined?

24 A. Yes. It was the pol- -- it was what was
25 then called the Policy and Abuse team.

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 33

1 Q. Trust & Safety was then called the Policy
2 and Abuse team?

3 A. Yeah. Back in -- back in 2009, Trust &
4 Safety wasn't really an industry term yet.

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. And so the team that I joined was called
7 Policy and Abuse.

8 Q. Okay. And was that Policy and Abuse
9 specific to ads and monetization?

10 A. The -- the team itself, you know, was
11 responsible for a lot of different areas. Policy,
12 content policy, abuse, legal support, copyright.

13 And when I joined, I joined this -- again,
14 this small team that had the -- you know, kind of --
15 doing a lot of different things. And there was an
16 opportunity -- no one was thinking about ads. And
17 so because no one was thinking about it and I was
18 new, I took it.

19 Q. Okay. And earlier you had said
20 Trust & Safety is sort of this industry term now?

21 A. Mm-hmm.

22 Q. Do I recall correctly?

23 In the context of your work at YouTube,
24 what -- what was the Trust & Safety team doing?

25 What was its purpose?

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 34

1 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

2 THE WITNESS: Very similar to what
3 Trust & Safety teams do today. You know, for all
4 the companies and platforms that had this team, we
5 were responsible for developing the policies that,
6 you know, determined what's allowed and not allowed
7 on our services, and then removing them when we're
8 made aware of them.

9 BY MS. TRUONG:

10 Q. Okay. And if I -- if you go into your
11 description for this senior manager,
12 Trust & Safety - YouTube Ads Monetization, the
13 second sentence says (as read):

14 You built a global team of
15 policy specialists and content
16 moderators who are responsible for
17 the enforcement of YouTube's
18 advertiser-friendly guidelines.

19 Do you see -- do you see that?

20 A. Yes.

21 Q. Is this focused on what type of content
22 should or shouldn't be on YouTube then?

23 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

24 THE WITNESS: This was focused on what
25 kind of content should not have ads run against

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 35

1 them.

2 BY MS. TRUONG:

3 Q. Okay. And why would you want to restrict
4 ad monetization on some content versus others?

5 A. Because some content isn't appropriate for
6 advertising. Yeah. That's what we mean by brand
7 safety. Like, it's not -- like, the monetization
8 standard, what both YouTube and the creator
9 should -- should monetize, should earn ad revenue
10 from, you know, these were the standards that
11 dictated them.

12 Q. Okay. And is ad monetization the primary
13 way in which YouTube made money?

14 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

15 THE WITNESS: At the time, yes.

16 BY MS. TRUONG:

17 Q. Okay. And ad monetization can happen
18 through contextual advertising; is that correct?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. And if I understand that correctly, that
21 would be based on the content of what's being viewed
22 in that moment, correct?

23 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

24 THE WITNESS: I don't know if I would say
25 it's based on the content that's viewed, but the

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 36

1 content category.

2 BY MS. TRUONG:

3 Q. Okay. How would you describe contextual
4 advertising?

5 A. Advertisers can target their ad campaigns
6 based on cont- -- content categories that they
7 select in the, like, creation of these campaign
8 settings.

9 Q. So, for example, they could target
10 children's content?

11 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

12 THE WITNESS: No. They could -- we didn't
13 have a children's content category setting.

14 BY MS. TRUONG:

15 Q. Okay. What types of categories did
16 YouTube have?

17 A. Like, entertainment.

18 Q. Okay.

19 A. Music, sports, categories like those.

20 Q. Okay. And then is another way advertising
21 can be done is through personalized advertising?

22 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

23 THE WITNESS: Yes.

24 BY MS. TRUONG:

25 Q. Is that sometimes also referred to as

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 37

1 targeted advertising?

2 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

3 THE WITNESS: I don't know.

4 BY MS. TRUONG:

5 Q. Okay. Focusing on personalized
6 advertising, what does that mean?

7 What type of advertising is that?

8 A. Campaigns that are targeted to the user
9 that's -- like, targeted to the audience.

10 Q. Okay. And how would you target the
11 audience?

12 What information would you need to do
13 that?

14 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

15 THE WITNESS: In the ad settings, you can
16 target based on demographic geo, gender.

17 BY MS. TRUONG:

18 Q. And in the context of YouTube ad and
19 monetization, is it correct that YouTube is able to
20 collect data points about users?

21 For example, YouTube can collect
22 information about what they watch, what they
23 searched for, the channels they land on and that
24 information can be used to facilitate targeted
25 advertising?

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 38

1 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

2 THE WITNESS: This was not really my scope
3 or my wheelhouse, so I can't really speak to that.

4 BY MS. TRUONG:

5 Q. Okay. Okay. In the last sentence of this
6 job description -- I'm sorry, the second to last
7 sentence, it says (as read):

8 Scaled enforcement of brand
9 safety policy by codeveloping
10 proprietary content ratings
11 classification system with video
12 ads and engineering team.

13 Do you see that?

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. What is a content ratings classification
16 system?

17 A. That's what -- so one of the products that
18 I oversaw was YouTube content ratings. And it is
19 similar to MPA ratings, TV ratings. It was our
20 proprietary system that would scan YouTube videos at
21 upload time, and then depending on content signals,
22 in the context that our machine-learning algorithms
23 could determine from these videos, we would issue --
24 we would classify that video one of, I believe, five
25 content ratings.

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 39

1 Q. And I -- I think you used the analogy of
2 film ratings.

3 A. (Nods head.)

4 Q. So, like, rated G?

5 A. G, PG, PG13.

6 Q. Thank you, I only had one example in my
7 head.

8 Okay. And then you said the
9 classification is intended to create these ratings,
10 and then it works off of content signals?

11 A. So the --

12 Q. What's --

13 A. I'm sorry to cut you off.

14 Q. What's the signal?

15 A. It could be, you know, a title, the
16 visual, the visual stream itself. Audio. It could
17 be one of many different signals.

18 Q. Who decides what signals should be used?

19 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

20 THE WITNESS: That -- the engineering
21 team.

22 BY MS. TRUONG:

23 Q. Okay. If we move to your next position,
24 from February 2018 to November of 2020, you're now
25 in the position of global lead, Trust & Safety -

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 40

1 Child Safety, Kids and Family Experiences, Crisis
2 Response.

3 You had your hands full?

4 A. Oh, yes.

5 Q. Okay. What does it mean to be a global
6 lead?

7 A. So I was responsible -- I had, under my
8 remit, global teams, you know, based in the U.S.,
9 San Bruno mostly, Dublin, Singapore, India, working
10 in these spaces.

11 Q. By "these spaces," you mean Trust &
12 Safety, but the subcategories here, child safety,
13 kids and family experiences and crisis response.

14 A. Correct. I had dedicated teams in each of
15 those verticals. We called them verticals.

16 Q. Verticals.

17 Who was your supervisor in this position?

18 A. Matt Halprin.

19 Q. And about how many direct reports did you
20 have?

21 A. Gosh. Let's see. I would say total,
22 maybe somewhere around 60.

23 Q. 60?

24 A. Yeah.

25 Q. Okay. And was someone in this role before

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 41

1 you took it over?

2 A. No. I don't -- there were people doing
3 this role. There were, of course, people doing
4 these roles, but we started -- as an organization,
5 we started verticalizing, so we just had specific
6 people dedicated to each of these verticals. And I
7 was the -- the first vertical lead definitely for
8 kids and family, I believe -- I remember there was
9 someone doing child safety prior to me, but the
10 first vertical lead for kids and family experiences
11 and crisis response.

12 Q. Who was doing child safety before you?

13 A. This -- this woman, [REDACTED]
14 (phonetic).

15 Q. [REDACTED]?

16 A. Yeah.

17 Q. And in the context of child safety, what
18 was the focus of your work?

19 A. It spanned several different content
20 issues, but at the core of it, it's protecting
21 minors from harm on YouTube, and, you know,
22 protecting them as creators and when they appeared
23 in YouTube videos.

24 Q. So I want to try to unpack this because
25 protecting minors from harm seems like a big

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 42

1 category.

2 In that context of protecting minors from
3 harm, were you doing some specific type of work?

4 A. We were developing the policies for child
5 safety. These policies include CSAM, and, of
6 course, CSAM policies already existed. So the
7 policies in CSAM, other sexually explicit activity.
8 When minors are, you know, shown in videos being
9 physically harmed, child abuse, you know, any kind
10 of violent context involving minors, when they are
11 doing harmful and dangerous acts, pranks and
12 challenges involving minors, when they're engaged in
13 age-inappropriate behavior, that was kind of --
14 those were the examples of the policies that we had
15 that my team would continue updating and iterating
16 with the different emerging trends and risks we were
17 seeing, as well as also enforcing against these
18 videos when we detect them and then removing the
19 ones that are violative of our policies.

20 Q. So was your focus in this role primarily
21 content-based?

22 A. Correct. The focus of my role in all of
23 these verticals is very much content-based.

24 Q. Okay. That's helpful. Thank you.

25 So with respect to kids and family

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 43

1 experiences, understanding it was content-based,
2 what types of things were you doing in that
3 vertical?

4 A. So a little different from child safety
5 where really our focus was protecting -- or
6 safeguarding the actual human being that we see in
7 videos, kids and family experiences, the focus is
8 really ensuring that minors using YouTube are
9 viewing age-appropriate content for them.

10 Q. Okay. In your description here, you have
11 listed YouTube Kids and supervised experiences.

12 Do you see that?

13 A. Yes.

14 Q. Okay. Does that fall within -- I'm sorry,
15 strike that. I got ahead of myself.

16 MR. WILLEN: Oh, yeah, I see.

17 BY MS. TRUONG:

18 Q. I'm sorry, it -- where it says (as read):

19 Developed content safety
20 policy for YouTube Kids.

21 Do you see the line?

22 A. Mm-hmm.

23 Q. (As read):

24 YouTube's flagship product for
25 our youngest users and the policies

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 44

1 enforcement framework for
2 Made-for-Kids, YouTube's COPPA
3 compliance solution.
4 Do you see that?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. What is Made-for-Kids?

7 A. Made-for-Kids is also a content policy
8 that is used to train a machine learning algorithm
9 that we have that essentially defines and describes
10 content that we believe is predominantly targeted or
11 appealing -- I'm sorry, let me use the word
12 appealing to younger kids, like preschool,
13 elementary-aged kids.

14 Q. What's the age range for preschool to
15 elementary?

16 A. Zero to 12.

17 Q. 12.

18 Is Made-for-Kids applied on YouTube Kids
19 or YouTube main?

20 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

21 THE WITNESS: Made-for-Kids is applied to
22 YouTube main.

23 BY MS. TRUONG:

24 Q. Okay. And let me take a step back.

25 When we talk about the YouTube platform,

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 45

1 do you understand that YouTube has a main platform?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Okay. And then there's also a YouTube
4 Kids platform; is that correct?

5 A. Correct.

6 Q. We had talked previously that this
7 launched in about 2014-2015; is that correct?

8 A. The kids app, yes.

9 Q. Okay. And in this last sentence in the
10 first paragraph, it says (as read):

11 You also assess child safety
12 risks for new YouTube products and
13 features.

14 Do you see that?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Do you agree that it's important for
17 companies to assess these types of risks with
18 respect to their products?

19 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

20 THE WITNESS: Yes.

21 BY MS. TRUONG:

22 Q. That this is a continuing obligation with
23 respect to the product, so as people start using it,
24 they continue to have to assess risk with respect to
25 child safety?

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 46

1 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the -- excuse
2 me. Objection to the form.

3 THE WITNESS: Yes.

4 BY MS. TRUONG:

5 Q. Okay. And then in the last paragraph, you
6 say you were the global lead of the YouTube crisis
7 response team.

8 Do you see that?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. What is the YouTube crisis response team?

11 A. This was a team we operated 24/7 to
12 respond to any escalations, content escalations that
13 arise around the world, that then is recorded
14 with -- content from those things are recorded and
15 uploaded to YouTube.

16 Q. Okay. What type of content escalations
17 would fall within the crisis rapid response team?

18 A. Anything from natural disasters to
19 terrorist attacks.

20 Q. Okay. All right. Home stretch.

21 Your last -- your last position with
22 YouTube was November of 2020 to August of 2022; is
23 that correct?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. And here you were director,

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 47

1 Trust & Safety?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Okay. Can you tell me what the difference
4 is director, Trust & Safety versus global lead of
5 Trust & Safety?

6 A. It -- I was promoted to a director.

7 Q. You got more money?

8 A. Yes. And in this role, the main change
9 from a scope perspective is I was no longer leading
10 the crisis response team in this role. And so still
11 child safety, still kids and family experiences, and
12 then content ratings kind of took the third slot
13 when I left the crisis response.

14 Q. Okay.

15 A. Vertical.

16 Q. Who was -- I'm sorry?

17 A. When I -- when I left the crisis response
18 team.

19 Q. Who was your supervisor in this role?

20 A. Matt Halprin.

21 Q. And about how many direct reports did you
22 have in this role?

23 A. I think 50 to 55.

24 Q. Was someone in this role prior to you
25 taking it on?

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 48

1 A. So I was -- child safety and kids and
2 family was still me, and then content ratings,
3 content -- content ratings, I had a team on the
4 Google side that then when content ratings
5 transitioned over to YouTube, I was -- it -- it
6 rolled up under my -- my leadership, my team.

7 Q. Okay. And the first sentence here says
8 that you were accountable for YouTube's
9 responsibility initiatives.

10 Do you see that?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And responsibility is capitalized.

13 Is that because it's a term of art of some
14 kind at YouTube?

15 A. A term of art?

16 Q. Yeah.

17 Does it mean -- what do you mean here,
18 YouTube's responsibility initiatives?

19 A. YouTube, you know, we -- we had an
20 internal north star where responsibility is our top
21 priority.

22 Q. What is a north star at YouTube?

23 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

24 THE WITNESS: It's -- I'm using it
25 colloquially. It's -- you know, it's kind of a

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 49

1 mission statement that aligns in our company around
2 regardless of what you're working on or what team
3 you're on.

4 BY MS. TRUONG:

5 Q. So regardless of what project you're
6 working on, you should keep that north star in mind
7 and aim to achieve that at all times?

8 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

9 THE WITNESS: That's how I interpret it.

10 BY MS. TRUONG:

11 Q. Okay. And the sentence continues (as
12 read):

13 Accountable for YouTube's
14 responsibility initiatives that
15 protect youth creators and viewers
16 on the platform, a top priority
17 across the company.

18 Do you see that?

19 A. Oh yeah, still on the first sentence.

20 Q. Yes.

21 A. Yes.

22 Q. I'm sorry.

23 Was the protection of youth creators and
24 viewers always a top priority at YouTube during your
25 time there?

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 50

1 A. Yes. Based on my experience.

2 Q. Okay. Who determines what is or isn't a
3 top priority at YouTube?

4 A. Our senior leadership team.

5 Q. And who is on the senior leadership team?

6 MR. WILLEN: Objection. Are you
7 talking -- what time are we talking about?

8 BY MS. TRUONG:

9 Q. Let's talk about the time that you were
10 director of Trust & Safety. So November 2020 to
11 August of 2022.

12 A. Our CEO, Susan Wojcicki, chief product
13 officer, Neal Mohan, our chief technology officer,
14 Scott Silverman, chief legal officer, who, during my
15 time, majority of my time there was Niko Austin
16 (phonetic). Yeah, so the C-suite.

17 Q. The C-suites. Okay.

18 If you go down to the second paragraph
19 here, you have sub-bullet one. It says that you (as
20 read):

21 Protect and educate tweens and
22 teens in the areas where they're
23 most vulnerable online and quickly
24 identifying and removing violative
25 content and accounts.

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 51

1 Do you see that?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. With respect to accounts, did you work at
4 all with removing underage accounts?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. And what age range did that apply to?

7 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

8 THE WITNESS: Twelve and under.

9 BY MS. TRUONG:

10 Q. And why were accounts for 12 and under
11 removed from YouTube?

12 A. Because we didn't allow 12 and under
13 accounts according to our TOS, our terms of service.

14 Q. Do you know why that policy is in place?

15 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

16 Excuse me.

17 THE WITNESS: No.

18 BY MS. TRUONG:

19 Q. Do you know who makes the decision of
20 whether or not to keep that policy in place?

21 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

22 THE WITNESS: No.

23 BY MS. TRUONG:

24 Q. Would that be a C-suite level decision.

25 A. Yes. I haven't really thought about it.

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 52

1 Q. Okay. And then the second bullet says
2 that you (as read):

3 Work with enriching the
4 world's families with appealing and
5 safe quality content (YouTube Kids
6 and supervised experiences).
7 Is that right?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Okay. In the context of YouTube Kids, I
10 think we discussed this earlier, you said it was
11 mostly content-based; is that right?

12 A. Yes.

13 Q. What about for supervised experiences, is
14 it the same or did you have a broader range of
15 issues you were working on there?

16 A. Also content-based.

17 Q. Okay. And then the last number, Number 3,
18 it says (as read):

19 Improve the consumer
20 experience with more
21 age-appropriate default settings
22 and controls.
23 Do you see that?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Okay. What age-appropriate default

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 53

1 settings were you working on?

2 A. This was the content ratings
3 classification product. Again, the G, PG.

4 Q. Okay. And what about age-appropriate
5 controls?

6 A. So how -- so how the content ratings --
7 it's essentially like a classification system. And
8 then other teams across YouTube, even Google, could
9 leverage this system to build -- to build their own
10 controls on top of, on top of that system.

11 Q. Okay. And then it looks like in September
12 of 2022 -- actually, no.

13 In August of 2022, you left YouTube,
14 Google; is that correct?

15 A. Correct.

16 Q. And then you joined Etsy, correct?

17 A. Yes.

18 Q. Was there anything in particular that
19 prompted that move?

20 A. I was just ready for a change. I've been
21 at Google for, gosh, it was almost 16 years at the
22 time, and so just ready for something new.

23 Q. Ms. Wu, as someone who has worked as
24 YouTube and in particular the Trust & Safety and
25 child safety departments, do you agree that it is

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 54

1 important for YouTube to protect children on the
2 YouTube platform?

3 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

4 THE WITNESS: Yes.

5 BY MS. TRUONG:

6 Q. Do you agree that YouTube has a
7 responsibility to ensure that its platform was safe
8 for children?

9 MR. WILLEN: Same objection.

10 THE WITNESS: Yes.

11 BY MS. TRUONG:

12 Q. Do you agree that if there were aspects of
13 the YouTube platform that was not safe for children,
14 YouTube should address those safety issues?

15 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

16 THE WITNESS: Yes.

17 BY MS. TRUONG:

18 Q. It should try to fix those issues?

19 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

20 THE WITNESS: Correct.

21 BY MS. TRUONG:

22 Q. Do you agree that YouTube should inform
23 parents of any safety issues with respect to the
24 YouTube platform?

25 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 55

1 THE WITNESS: Yes.

2 BY MS. TRUONG:

3 Q. That YouTube should inform the public
4 generally of any safety issues with respect to its
5 platform?

6 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

7 THE WITNESS: I -- that, again, was -- I
8 was just very much focused on the content, but there
9 were teams where that was their, you know -- they
10 were -- they oversaw the external communications. I
11 was very much more focused internally on the
12 contents.

13 BY MS. TRUONG:

14 Q. Okay. Understood.

15 Asking just a broader question about
16 whether you agree that YouTube should inform the
17 public generally about any safety issues involving
18 its platform?

19 MR. WILLEN: Excuse me. Just objection to
20 the form.

21 THE WITNESS: Yes. And that is one of the
22 reasons why we have a quarterly transparency report.

23 BY MS. TRUONG:

24 Q. Earlier you had stated that 12 and under
25 users were not allowed on YouTube based on the terms

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 56

1 of service; is that correct?

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. Okay.

4 MR. WILLEN: Sorry.

5 BY MS. TRUONG:

6 Q. How does YouTube ensure that under -- 12
7 and under are not on the platform?

8 A. In the -- I'm -- that's a lot -- a little
9 bit out of my purview, it's -- actually, it is out
10 of my purview, but in the -- in the account signup
11 flow on YouTube main there are protections in place.

12 Q. Were you involved in the account signup
13 flow during your time at YouTube?

14 A. No.

15 Q. Okay. If I had questions about how that
16 flow worked at YouTube, who would I ask?

17 A. Someone in the product or engineering
18 team.

19 Q. Product or engineering team?

20 A. Mm-hmm.

21 Q. And is there someone on the product or
22 engineering team that deals specifically with
23 account creation flow for children?

24 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

25 THE WITNESS: I really don't remember.

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 57

1 BY MS. TRUONG:

2 Q. Okay. Are you aware that children can
3 access the YouTube platform in a signed-out mode?

4 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

5 THE WITNESS: Sure. Young people can view
6 YouTube in logged-out mode.

7 BY MS. TRUONG:

8 Q. What's logged-out mode?

9 A. Same as signed out.

10 Q. Signed out. Okay.

11 In other words, you don't need a YouTube
12 account to access YouTube; is that right?

13 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

14 THE WITNESS: You don't need a YouTube
15 account to view the content.

16 BY MS. TRUONG:

17 Q. Okay.

18 A. However, in -- when you're not logged into
19 an account, the content experience is different.
20 The content that we show in signed-out mode is -- is
21 different. We restrict lots of types of content.
22 Mostly for safety reasons, content safety when
23 you're log -- not logged in.

24 Q. What about the feature experiences on
25 YouTube; is there a change when you're signed out?

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 58

1 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

2 THE WITNESS: I don't know.

3 BY MS. TRUONG:

4 Q. Okay. And let me clarify. By "features,"
5 I mean, the way videos are recommended on YouTube.

6 There's no change to that whether you're
7 signed out, right?

8 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

9 THE WITNESS: I don't know.

10 BY MS. TRUONG:

11 Q. Okay. I'm going to mark --

12 MR. WILLEN: Are we done with this?

13 MS. TRUONG: Yes. We can set those aside.

14 MR. WILLEN: Thank you.

15 MS. TRUONG: -- as Exhibit 4 to this
16 deposition a document that's Bates Number -03877873.

17 (Whereupon, Deposition Exhibit 4
18 was marked for identification.)

19 MS. TRUONG: While we tee that up, I'll
20 just note for the record, it's an email sent from
21 the email account of [REDACTED] dated
22 April 18 of 2014.

23 MR. WILLEN: Thanks. That's for you.

24 BY MS. TRUONG:

25 Q. Ms. Wu, just at the top there, that email,

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 59

1 is this your work email is this --

2 A. Yes.

3 Q. -- at Google? I'm sorry.

4 Is this the email you use to communicate
5 regarding any business communications?

6 A. Yes.

7 Q. Okay. The subject line here says "Unicorn
8 Update."

9 What is unicorn?

10 MR. WILLEN: Have you had a chance to look
11 at the document?

12 THE WITNESS: Yeah. I'm looking at it
13 right now.

14 MS. TRUONG: I'm sorry.

15 MR. WILLEN: Why don't you give her a
16 chance to take a look at it.

17 THE WITNESS: So unicorn, from what I
18 remember -- I haven't heard that or thought about it
19 in a very long time. But unicorn was a cross -- it
20 was a cross Google initiative that was focused on
21 exploring different product experiences for kids.

22 BY MS. TRUONG:

23 Q. Okay. If we can flip to the page with the
24 Bates Number ending -7876 at the bottom. And I'm
25 going to start with the email from [REDACTED].

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 60

1 Date is Tuesday, April 8th, 2014 at 8:52 p.m.

2 Just let me know when you get there.

3 A. Yes. I'm here.

4 Q. Okay. Who is [REDACTED]?

5 A. Well, I know [REDACTED]. I don't recall --
6 recall what role she was in at the time, but you can
7 see her little tag handle. She's a policy advisor.
8 She was on the Google Trust & Safety policy team. I
9 also don't see my -- I'm not a recipient on
10 [REDACTED]'s email.

11 Q. Understood.

12 I think at some point you are looped in --
13 into this conversation --

14 A. Yes.

15 Q. -- is that correct?

16 A. Yes. But I -- I'm not on that -- yeah,
17 looped in later, I guess.

18 Q. Okay. Why don't we do this. Let's go to
19 the page with Bates Number -7874 at the top. I
20 think this is your first active response on this
21 email chain. And it's Friday, April 18, 2014 at
22 9:12 a.m.

23 Do you see that?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Okay. If you could just take a moment

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 61

1 review this.

2 A. Okay.

3 Q. Okay. In this email, you're discussing
4 the ads decision with respect to YouTube Kids; is
5 that correct?

6 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

7 THE WITNESS: I don't -- I'm sorry, I
8 don't want to speculate. I don't recall. This was
9 a long time ago.

10 BY MS. TRUONG:

11 Q. Okay. You see the second sentence where
12 it says (as read):

13 My first reaction to hearing
14 the news was concerning as well,
15 but after having various
16 conversation with folks and time to
17 carefully think through the
18 implementation of ads under the
19 current serving controls we have, I
20 think we can pull this off
21 responsibly.

22 Do you see this?

23 A. Yes.

24 Q. Okay. What is this in response to?

25 A. So I know it was -- this email chain is

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 62

1 about ads on kid-friendly content. What I don't
2 recall is if it was actually ads in the kids app.

3 Q. I see.

4 A. What I do remember is we actually launched
5 the kids app without ads.

6 Q. Kids was launched -- YouTube Kids app was
7 launched --

8 A. Was launched with no ads.

9 Q. Okay. So what is the -- when you say the
10 news was -- you were concerned about the news as
11 well, what did you mean by that?

12 A. I don't recall.

13 Q. Okay.

14 A. And this was a very long time ago.

15 Q. Okay. When you say, "The ads decision is
16 supported by Susan," are you referring to
17 Susan Wojcicki -- am I saying her name right -- the
18 CEO at the time?

19 A. Yes.

20 Q. How do you pronounce her last name? I
21 don't want to butcher it throughout this.

22 A. Wujiski.

23 Q. Wujiski. Okay.

24 And in the second paragraph, you discuss
25 (as read):

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 63

1 Content licensing agreement
2 with many of content owners, like
3 Disney, Cartoon Network and Sesame
4 Street, where we're contractually
5 bound to monetize their content.
6 Do you see that?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. It appears to me that -- that this was a
9 consideration as to why kids content was being
10 monetized in some aspect at this point; is that
11 right?

12 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

13 THE WITNESS: Yes. On YouTube main app.

14 BY MS. TRUONG:

15 Q. On YouTube main app.

16 And if we can just go to the last page of
17 the document, I know you said you weren't in on this
18 email originally, though, you were looped. I want
19 to ask broadly about this paragraph where it
20 references (as read):

21 Unicorn policy principals, ten
22 things we know to be true.
23 Do you see that?

24 A. Yes.

25 Q. Okay. So -- and it looks like those ten

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 64

1 things are then bullet points. The third bullet
2 being (as read):

3 Parents will have meaningful
4 choice about their children's
5 experience.

6 Do you see that?

7 A. Yes.

8 Q. Do you agree with that statement?

9 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

10 THE WITNESS: Yes.

11 BY MS. TRUONG:

12 Q. In the context of your work in
13 Trust & Safety and child safety, do you agree that
14 meaningful choice means informed choice?

15 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

16 THE WITNESS: I -- I believe meaningful
17 choice is, like, content experiences that they can
18 select on what's best for their kids and their
19 families.

20 BY MS. TRUONG:

21 Q. So in this context, you -- you view
22 "meaningful choice" as having choice of content?

23 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

24 THE WITNESS: YouTube Kids app, supervised
25 experiences, that they have more choice on the

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 65

1 content experience they feel is most appropriate and
2 suitable for their family.

3 BY MS. TRUONG:

4 Q. Okay. And would you agree that in order
5 to execute their choice between those experiences,
6 they should be informed about all the risks and
7 benefits of what they're choosing?

8 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

9 THE WITNESS: Yes.

10 BY MS. TRUONG:

11 Q. Okay. I'm going to mark as Exhibit 5 to
12 this deposition a document with Bates
13 ending -01621450.

14 (Whereupon, Deposition Exhibit 5
15 was marked for identification.)

16 MR. WILLEN: Thanks. Let's put that
17 there. This is for you.

18 BY MS. TRUONG:

19 Q. Ms. Wu, if you just want to take a moment
20 to review it and let me know when you're ready.

21 A. Okay.

22 Q. Okay. If we go to the page with Bates
23 ending -1453, we'll start at mid page, Monday,
24 March 6, 2017, an 11:52 email from you to
25 [REDACTED]; is that right?

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 82

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Okay. As the director of Trust & Safety,
3 were you involved at all on how the recommendation
4 algorithm was operated on the YouTube Kids platform?

5 A. No. That was not within my remit.

6 Q. Okay. What about how the algo- --
7 recommendation algorithm worked on YouTube main with
8 respect to kids?

9 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

10 THE WITNESS: No.

11 BY MS. TRUONG:

12 Q. Okay. The next sentence says (as read):
13 Unlike on traditional YouTube,
14 YouTube Kids auto plays new videos
15 without warning with no option to
16 turn off the feature.
17 Do you see that?

18 A. Yeah.

19 Q. Were you involved at all on how auto play
20 was provided on YouTube Kids?

21 A. No.

22 Q. What about how auto play was provided on
23 YouTube main?

24 A. No. Again, my -- my team, me and my team,
25 Trust & Safety at large, we were focused on content,

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 83

1 not product features.

2 Q. Was there -- let me go back.

3 You said on Trust & Safety, you had three
4 verticals; is that right?

5 A. Mm-hmm.

6 Q. It was, at one point, rapid response, but
7 that got taken off your plate, mainly child safety;
8 is that correct?

9 A. Mm-hmm.

10 Q. Kids experience, correct?

11 A. Yes.

12 Q. And content ratings?

13 A. Content ratings.

14 Q. Was there a vertical that dealt with sort
15 of the recommendation algorithm in children?

16 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

17 THE WITNESS: Not in Trust & Safety.

18 BY MS. TRUONG:

19 Q. Not in Trust & Safety. Okay.

20 If you turn to the page with Bates
21 Number -9686, there's a paragraph that says (as
22 read):

23 Studies have shown that too
24 much screen time for preschool-aged
25 children can lead to damage in

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 84

1 regions of the brain related to
2 literacy, language, processing and
3 speech.

4 Do you see that?

5 A. Yes.

6 Q. The paragraph goes on to discuss
7 additional studies with how screen time can impact
8 children negatively; is that fair?

9 A. Yes.

10 Q. As part of your work in Trust & Safety,
11 did you ever encounter this type of research?

12 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

13 THE WITNESS: My team and I did not -- oh,
14 no.

15 BY MS. TRUONG:

16 Q. Was that --

17 A. Sorry.

18 Q. Sorry.

19 MR. WILLEN: Sorry, what's the question?

20 THE WITNESS: No. We did not encounter
21 this research.

22 BY MS. TRUONG:

23 Q. Okay. Was this an area that you would
24 have looked into as part of your work on
25 Trust & Safety?

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 85

1 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form.

2 THE WITNESS: No.

3 BY MS. TRUONG:

4 Q. Okay.

5 A. We -- we were focused on content safety,
6 content appropriateness. There were other teams
7 focused on digital wellbeing.

8 Q. Who was the team focused on digital
9 wellbeing?

10 MR. WILLEN: Objection to the form. Are
11 we talking about at this time?

12 MS. TRUONG: At this time.

13 THE WITNESS: You'd have to -- so
14 [REDACTED] comes to mind, and I know there
15 were product teams in the -- individuals on the
16 product team focused on digital wellbeing.

17 BY MS. TRUONG:

18 Q. Okay. What about at the time that you
19 left YouTube, which was in about 2022, who was
20 handling digital wellbeing at that time?

21 A. I want to say [REDACTED].

22 Q. And what's [REDACTED] --

23 A. Actually, I'm sorry, I think [REDACTED] -- I
24 know she ended up -- she's no longer at YouTube, but
25 I don't know when she left.

CONFIDENTIAL

Page 242

CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER

I, Kathleen A. Maltbie, Certified Shorthand Reporter licensed in the State of California, License No. 10068, the State of Nevada, CCR 995, and the State of Texas, CSR 12212, hereby certify that deponent was by me first duly sworn, and the foregoing testimony was reported by me and was thereafter transcribed with computer-aided transcription; that the foregoing is a full, complete, and true record of proceedings.

I further certify that I am not of counsel or attorney for either or any of the parties in the foregoing proceeding and caption named or in any way interested in the outcome of the cause in said caption.

The dismantling, unsealing, or unbinding of the original transcript will render the reporter's certificates null and void.

In witness whereof, I have hereunto set my hand this day:

 x Reading and Signing was requested.

 Reading and Signing was waived

 R^e Kathleen Maltbie tested.

KATHLEEN A. MALTBIE

RPR-RMR-CRR-CCRR-CLR-CRC-RDR

California CSR 10068, Nevada CCR 995

Texas CSR 12212