

AMENDED Exhibit 766

**PLAINTIFFS' OMNIBUS OPPOSITION TO
DEFENDANTS' MOTIONS FOR SUMMARY
JUDGMENT**

Case No.: 4:22-md-03047-YGR

MDL No. 3047

In Re: Social Media Adolescent Addiction/Personal Injury Products Liability Litigation

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 443

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

-----X
IN RE: SOCIAL MEDIA ADOLESCENT) Case No. 4:22-md-
ADDICTION/PERSONAL INJURY) 3047-YGR
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION) MDL No. 3047
-----X

CONTAINS HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION

V O L U M E II
VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF JAMES BESER
PALO ALTO, CALIFORNIA
APRIL 3, 2025
9:21 A.M.

Job No.: 7224255
Pages: 443 - 819
Reported by: Leslie A. Todd, CSR No. 5129 and RPR

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 444

1 Videotaped deposition of JAMES BESER, VOLUME
2 II, held at the offices of:

3
4
5 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI, LLP
6 650 Page Mill Road
7 Palo Alto, California 94304-1001
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17

18 Pursuant to notice, before Leslie Anne Todd,
19 California Certified Shorthand Reporter in and for
20 the State of California, who officiated in
21 administering the oath to the witness.
22
23
24
25

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 445

1 A P P E A R A N C E S

2

3 ON BEHALF OF JCCP PLAINTIFFS:

4 GLENN DRAPER, ESQUIRE

5 SOCIAL MEDIA VICTIMS' LAW CENTER

6 Seattle, Washington

7 (800) 687-1855

8

9 AN V. TRUONG, ESQUIRE

10 REILLY DUNNE, ESQUIRE

11 ELLYN HURD, ESQUIRE (via Zoom)

12 SIMMONS HANLY & CONROY

13 112 Madison Avenue, 7th Floor

14 New York, New York 10016-7416

15 (866) 347-4322

16

17 ON BEHALF OF THE MDL PLAINTIFFS:

18 AUDREY SIEGEL, ESQUIRE

19 SEEGER WEISS LLP

20 55 Challenger Road

21 Ridgefield Park, New Jersey 07660

22 (973) 639-9100

23

24

25

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 446

1 APPEARANCES (Continued):

2
3 ON BEHALF OF GOOGLE LLC and YOUTUBE, LLC
4 DEFENDANTS:

5 NEELUM WADHWANI, ESQUIRE

6 LYDIA WEIANT, ESQUIRE (via Zoom)

7 WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLC

8 680 Maine Avenue, SW

9 Washington, DC 20024

10 (202) 434-5547

11
12 ANDREW KRAMER, ESQUIRE

13 SAVANNAH GRANT, ESQUIRE

14 CHRIS CHIOU, ESQUIRE

15 SAMANTHA ALEXANDRIA-BOOTH MACHOCK, ESQUIRE

16 (via Zoom)

17 WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI, LLP

18 650 Page Mill Road

19 Palo Alto, California 94304-1001

20 (650) 849-3182

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 447

1 APPEARANCES (Continued):

2

3 ON BEHALF OF THE TIKTOK DEFENDANTS:

4 KEVIN J. WHITE, ESQUIRE (via Zoom)

5 GIBSON DUNN & CRUTCHER, LLP

6 310 University Avenue

7 Palo Alto, California 94301-1744

8 (650) 849-5300

9

10 ON BEHALF OF THE META DEFENDANTS:

11 HANNAH T. SANCHEZ, ESQUIRE (via Zoom)

12 LAURIE HENRY, ESQUIRE (via Zoom)

13 SHOOK HARDY & BACON, LLP

14 2555 Grand Boulevard

15 Kansas City, Missouri 64108

16 (816) 474-6550

17

18 ON BEHALF OF SNAP INC.:

19 KAYSIE GONZALEZ, ESQUIRE (via Zoom)

20 PRISCILA CORONADO, ESQUIRE (via Zoom)

21 MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON, LLP

22 350 South Grand Avenue, 50th Floor

23 Los Angeles, California 90071-3426

24 (213) 683-9100

25

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 448

1 APPEARANCES (Continued):

2

3 ALSO PRESENT:

4 DENISHA BACCHUS, ESQUIRE (In-house Google)

5 RAVEN NORRIS, ESQUIRE (In-house Google)

6 MARISSA URBAN, ESQUIRE (In-house YouTube)

7 (via Zoom)

8 JEROME MITCHELL (via Zoom)

9 JAMES VONWIEGEN, Videographer

10 JIM LOPEZ, Trial Technician

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 455

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 -----

3 THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are now
4 on the record. Today's date is
5 April 3rd, 2025.

6 This is a continuation of James
7 Beser's dep in the Social Media
8 Adolescent Addiction/Personal Injury
9 Products Liability Litigation. The
10 time is 9:21 a.m.

11 The court reporter is Leslie
12 Todd, California CSR 5129, who will
13 now swear in the witness.

14 JAMES BESER,
15 and having been first duly sworn,
16 was examined and testified as follows:

17 EXAMINATION

18 BY MS. SIEGEL:

19 Q. Good morning, Mr. Beser. I
20 hope you had a pleasant evening last night.

21 A. Good morning. You too.

22 Q. Okay. So we'll go ahead and
23 get started. First, just sort of as a
24 recordkeeping issue, yesterday my colleague
25 introduced one of your performance reviews

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 456

1 that was produced by counsel as part of your
2 personnel file.

3 MS. SIEGEL: I'm going to go
4 ahead and mark as the next exhibit,
5 which is Exhibit 39, the remainder of
6 what was produced.

7 (YouTube Beser Exhibit No. 39 was
8 marked for identification.)

9 THE WITNESS: All right.

10 BY MS. SIEGEL:

11 Q. If you could just take a look
12 at that and confirm that those look like your
13 performance reviews.

14 MS. WADHWANI: There's a
15 document here that does not appear --

16 MS. SIEGEL: Yeah, thank you.
17 I agree, this does not look like part
18 of your performance.

19 MS. WADHWANI: All right. So
20 take a moment to look through that
21 carefully, kind of shuffle through
22 each of those documents to make sure
23 that it reflects your performance
24 reviews.

25 MS. SIEGEL: We're not going to

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 462

1 schools if it's accessed by students on their
2 phones. Is that true?

3 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
4 form.

5 THE WITNESS: I am aware that
6 users -- sorry, students can bring up
7 their device and -- and access
8 non-school related material on their
9 device.

10 BY MS. SIEGEL:

11 Q. Including YouTube?

12 A. I would assume including
13 YouTube.

14 Q. Are you aware of any concerns
15 from teachers or school administrators that
16 the use of YouTube by kids before or during
17 school can lead to issues with learning?

18 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
19 form, foundation.

20 THE WITNESS: I am aware of
21 some of that feedback.

22 MS. SIEGEL: Okay. Can we mark
23 as the next exhibit, which will be
24 Exhibit 40, Bates number 01640828.

25 (YouTube Beser Exhibit No. 40 was

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 463

1 marked for identification.)

2 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

3 BY MS. SIEGEL:

4 Q. Okay. And I will direct you to
5 the first e-mail in time. And it says:
6 "Dear families: I just want to touch base
7 about a conversation I had about screen time
8 with kids. I know I mentioned this at
9 back-to-school night, and it's something my
10 children's TK teacher and K teachers
11 addressed with me. But if it is at all
12 possible to limit children's screen time
13 before school, that would be beneficial."

14 Do you see that?

15 A. I do.

16 Q. Do you recall this e-mail?

17 A. I do recall this e-mail.

18 Q. What was the context of this
19 e-mail?

20 A. This e-mail was from my, I
21 believe, son's teacher to -- to the class,
22 and I was on that e-mail.

23 Q. Okay. And then it says on --
24 in the second paragraph, it says: "Not in
25 the article - teachers are struggling widely

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 464

1 with an increase of fine motor issues in
2 their classrooms and children that struggle
3 with impulse control and instant
4 gratification, and there's much talk among us
5 about how the increase with these things is
6 tied to the increase in iPad/iPhone use."

7 Do you see that?

8 A. Yes.

9 Q. Did this concern you that --
10 that your son's principal was concerned about
11 the use of YouTube and screens prior to the
12 start of school?

13 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
14 form.

15 THE WITNESS: Just to correct
16 you quickly, this was my son's
17 kindergarten teacher.

18 BY MS. SIEGEL:

19 Q. I apologize.

20 A. That's okay.

21 And, yeah, I thought it was
22 some feedback. We get lots of feedback from
23 lots of places. I remember Ms. [REDACTED],
24 she's a delightful woman, and I wanted to
25 take that feedback seriously, as we always do

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 465

1 when we hear such things.

2 As you can see, I forwarded it
3 along to the team, and there's some
4 discussion here about where the proper team
5 to address such an issue might be. As you
6 can see from [REDACTED] [REDACTED], we should
7 check on -- he refers to the Unicorn team
8 here, which is the device level supervision
9 team at Google, not at YouTube, which I
10 agreed at the time was the right place to
11 address some of the concerns raised in the
12 e-mail.

13 Q. Sure. So in short, in response
14 to this e-mail, you did ask to see if there
15 was something -- sorry. Strike that.

16 Can you -- your response
17 actually says -- when you forward it, it
18 says: "FYI - we could think about doing
19 something different by day part at some
20 point." Right?

21 A. Yeah. If I put "FYI" in front
22 of it, it's, Here's an initial hot take, and,
23 you know, the team should think more deeply
24 about it.

25 Q. Sure. And if you look at Raj

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 466

1 Iyengar's response at the top --

2 A. Okay.

3 Q. -- it says: "I actually
4 discussed this with" -- I can't pronounce
5 that name.

6 A. [REDACTED].

7 Q. "I actually discussed this with
8 [REDACTED] earlier this week, in the context of
9 potentially revamping the timer."

10 And then it says: "55 percent
11 of Unicorn accounts have no time issue
12 schedules set typically for bedtime cutoff."

13 So it looks like over half of
14 the Unicorn users were using the feature of a
15 time -- time cutoff, and that 35 percent had
16 daily usage limits.

17 Do you see that?

18 A. I do see that.

19 Q. So it looks like Mr. Iyengar
20 agreed that it might be a good idea to set
21 particular time limits on the use of YouTube.
22 Is that fair?

23 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
24 form.

25 And just so the record is clear

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 467

1 for the court reporter, the statement
2 in the question, "So it looks like
3 over half the Unicorn users were using
4 a feature of a time cutoff" was not in
5 the document itself. Ms. Siegel was
6 reading it and inserting something.

7 So I just want to make sure we
8 have the quotes in the right place
9 about what the document says versus
10 your question.

11 THE WITNESS: Yeah, let me read
12 that bullet.

13 "55 percent of Unicorn
14 accounts," right. So Raj is relaying
15 back to the team what he learned from
16 the Unicorn team about the Unicorn
17 timer, which is the right place for
18 such limits to exist, at the device
19 level.

20 BY MS. SIEGEL:

21 Q. Okay. Who is [REDACTED]

22 [REDACTED] ?

23 A. [REDACTED] [REDACTED] was my eng
24 partner on the YouTube team up until like
25 '22, '23.

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 468

1 Q. And it looks like that
2 suggestion was to check the usage on Unicorn
3 timers to see if it's worthwhile doing
4 something similar, right? So the idea
5 being -- well, right. That's what it says?

6 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
7 form.

8 THE WITNESS: The sentence is
9 ambiguous. We should really check the
10 usage on Unicorn timers to see if it's
11 worthwhile doing something similar. I
12 actually don't know if he's referring
13 to Unicorn doing more or YouTube.
14 Either way, when we look at this
15 problem and we get feedback like this
16 and we think about it, every time we
17 think about it the proper and most
18 impactful place would be to have a
19 parent control at the device level.

20 Q. Did you express any -- did you
21 express to anyone on the Unicorn team that
22 you thought it would make sense to create a
23 timer by time of day?

24 A. So Raj mentions he discussed
25 this with [REDACTED]. I don't know the nature

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 469

1 of that conversation.

2 Q. Is [REDACTED] on the Unicorn team?

3 A. He was at the time.

4 Q. Okay. And did you -- since
5 2018, have there been any further discussions
6 or conversations at YouTube about creating a
7 time of day parent- -- parental control?

8 A. We talk about all kinds of
9 ideas and, you know, look at all the options
10 available that are reasonable to address
11 feedback and make the product better. And
12 whenever we come to this issue of timers,
13 it's a tricky thing as just one app on a
14 phone or one website in the web. Right.

15 So device level continues to be
16 the best use of a parent control for
17 something like this. Parents are busy,
18 parents have a lot coming at them, and it
19 makes the most sense to give them the choices
20 that are the most meaningful. And at Google,
21 that would mean in this context a timer --
22 potentially a timer at the device level.

23 Q. You work with the Unicorn team
24 for other parental control settings, right?
25 Fair to say?

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 470

1 A. Yes.

2 Q. Okay. And so in your
3 conversations with the Unicorn team on other
4 parental controls, have you raised the
5 possibility of doing a time-of-day setting?

6 A. I don't recall exactly if I
7 raised it, but I do know that the Unicorn
8 team has launched a school time feature. I
9 don't know if -- exactly the details of that
10 feature, but I would assume that they were
11 hearing this feedback from a lot of places.

12 Q. Okay. Great.

13 Is the -- is the school time
14 feature that you just discussed, was that
15 launched at the end of last year in August of
16 2024, on or around?

17 A. That sounds about right.

18 Q. Or at least it was announced in
19 August 2024?

20 A. Sounds about right.

21 Q. Okay. I'll mark for you as the
22 next exhibit, Exhibit 41, which is a printout
23 from Google's web page.

24 A. Okay.

25 (YouTube Beser Exhibit No. 41 was

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 471

1 marked for identification.)

2 BY MS. SIEGEL:

3 Q. And if you look on the second
4 page, it says: "We regularly engage with
5 parents when designing products and often
6 hear from parents who do not want their
7 children distracted at school, but still want
8 to be able to get in touch in case of
9 emergency."

10 Do you see that?

11 A. I do see that.

12 Q. Do you have any idea why it was
13 not until recently that that product was
14 launched?

15 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
16 form, foundation.

17 THE WITNESS: I don't know all
18 the inputs to the decision for the
19 Unicorn team on this topic.

20 BY MS. SIEGEL:

21 Q. Okay. Are you aware of
22 whether -- or rather, strike that.

23 Have you seen complaints dating
24 back to 2020 for requests for an app control
25 timer in Family Link?

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 472

1 A. That does not ring a bell, but
2 Family Link, I believe since launch, does
3 allow parents to set app level blocks and I
4 believe times -- time usage per day.

5 Q. And just to be clear, can you
6 explain what Family Link is versus YouTube
7 controls?

8 A. Of course. Family Link is the
9 service by Google that is a set of parental
10 controls focused on helping parents manage
11 their child's Android device usage. So it
12 has rules in place about what apps the kid is
13 able to download. It has filters for
14 websites, things like that, timers. You
15 know, the device has a, you know, allowable
16 usage at the device level, right.

17 And then per app, such as
18 YouTube or YouTube Kids, you can go in and
19 set -- they have a pretty sophisticated
20 calendaring feature where you can pick day of
21 week, time of day, sort of allow device time
22 on/off controls.

23 MS. SIEGEL: Okay. Let's go
24 ahead and mark as the next exhibit
25 Bates number 01804303, and that's

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 476

1 any of those discussions.

2 MS. SIEGEL: Let's go to the
3 next exhibit, which is going to, be
4 for the record, 00252982. And this is
5 exhibit --

6 MS. WADHWANI: Oops, sorry.
7 Sorry.

8 MS. SIEGEL: -- Exhibit 43.
9 (YouTube Beser Exhibit No. 43 was
10 marked for identification.)

11 THE WITNESS: Okay.

12 BY MS. SIEGEL:

13 Q. And this is another document
14 that was produced in your custodial file, it
15 likes like, as part of the Unicorn Dog Food
16 discussion group. Is that fair?

17 A. Can I get acquainted with the
18 document, please?

19 Q. Yeah.

20 A. (Peruses document.) Okay.

21 Q. Okay. And so here, this is
22 a request -- or this -- if you look at the
23 first e-mail in time, it says: "My son was
24 using his phone around 2:30 p.m., and I
25 revised bedtimes to be 10:00 p.m. to

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 477

1 p.m. during school days."

2 A. I do see that.

3 Q. And so basically that -- that
4 is an indication that the bedtime
5 limitation -- strike that -- that individuals
6 are interested in using the bedtime time
7 setting to apply to schools as well. Is that
8 fair?

9 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
10 form, foundation --

11 THE WITNESS: It sounds --

12 MS. WADHWANI: -- calls for
13 speculation.

14 Go ahead.

15 THE WITNESS: Yeah, it sounds
16 like [REDACTED] is interested in that. I
17 don't know if that's a user request
18 that they saw at scale.

19 BY MS. SIEGEL:

20 Q. Okay. And then if you look at
21 an e-mail March 3rd, 2021, [REDACTED] [REDACTED] replies:
22 "I have the same problem. Bedtime configured
23 from 6:30 to 4:00 p.m., so when homework is
24 done and I want to open things up 30 minutes
25 early, I have to poke at the bonus time

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 478

1 button" --

2 I'll stop there.

3 A. Mm-hmm.

4 Q. But is that person expressing
5 that they're similarly having to use the
6 bedtime feature in order to lock apps during
7 school hours?

8 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
9 form, foundation.

10 THE WITNESS: I mean just
11 reading what [REDACTED] wrote, it sounds like
12 she's describing a similar use as
13 [REDACTED].

14 BY MS. SIEGEL:

15 Q. Okay. And is this -- do you
16 recall in 2021 whether there were any
17 conversations at either YouTube or with the
18 Unicorn team to create a time of day use
19 restriction at this point?

20 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
21 form.

22 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I don't
23 recall.

24 MS. SIEGEL: Okay. We'll mark
25 the next exhibit, which is Exhibit 44.

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 479

1 And for the record, this is -- this is
2 Bates numbered 01804655.

3 (YouTube Beser Exhibit No. 44 was
4 marked for identification.)

5 BY MS. SIEGEL:

6 Q. Okay. And there is another --
7 this is another e-mail, right, to the Unicorn
8 Dog Food discussion, and it has a third
9 person, [REDACTED] [REDACTED], who says: "I am also
10 using bedtime to keep device locked during
11 the day, 7:15 to 4:00 p.m. the next day."

12 Do you see that?

13 A. I see that.

14 Q. And so that's at least three
15 Dog Fooders who mentioned that they were
16 needing to use time control apps awkwardly or
17 inappropriately in order to lock the children
18 from using their devices at school or certain
19 apps at school. Is that fair?

20 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
21 form, foundation, mischaracterizes the
22 document.

23 THE WITNESS: I'm just reading
24 what [REDACTED] wrote. He's using bedtime
25 to keep device locked during the day

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 480

1 7:15 to 4:00 p.m. the next day. He
2 believes that is not the intended use
3 case. That's what he wrote.

4 BY MS. SIEGEL:

5 Q. Okay, great.

6 MS. SIEGEL: Let's go to the
7 next exhibit, which is going to be
8 01805840.

9 (YouTube Beser Exhibit No. 45 was
10 marked for identification.)

11 BY MS. SIEGEL:

12 Q. And this is another e-mail
13 approximately eight months later, later in
14 November of 2021, that was sent to the Dog
15 Food -- the Unicorn Dog Food discussion
16 group.

17 And if you go to the second
18 page of the e-mail, which is 5841, the
19 third -- what's marked number 3, it says:
20 "Another idea is location-based controls so
21 can prohibit use of certain apps in places
22 like school or other classes."

23 Do you see that?

24 A. I do.

25 Q. Okay. And then if you go to

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 481

1 the first page -- well, okay.

2 And if you go about midway
3 down -- or actually, strike that.

4 So is this a third person --
5 yet another person who's sort of expressing
6 that they would like to be able to limit the
7 use of certain apps at school?

8 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
9 form, foundation, mischaracterizes the
10 document.

11 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I mean I
12 would have to familiarize myself with
13 the whole e-mail. It's quite lengthy.

14 But the thing you pointed out
15 is, you know, Google or parents musing
16 about different ways to improve Family
17 Link controls.

18 BY MS. SIEGEL:

19 Q. Okay. We can -- you can put
20 that aside, and we can move to the -- well,
21 this idea was to use a -- strike that.

22 This idea that was presented
23 here was to use a location-based setting in
24 order to block the device. Is that fair?

25 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 482

1 form.

2 THE WITNESS: That's what the
3 e-mail has suggested.

4 BY MS. SIEGEL:

5 Q. Right. And so is YouTube or
6 Google actually either able to determine the
7 location where the app is opened or YouTube
8 is being used?

9 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
10 form, foundation.

11 THE WITNESS: So I don't work
12 on location signals. I can't really
13 speak to what we can and cannot do. I
14 know that location is a complicated
15 area with lots of privacy concerns and
16 different levels of technical ability,
17 like precise location versus other
18 things. And that's as much as I
19 really know about that issue.

20 MS. SIEGEL: Let's go ahead and
21 mark as the next exhibit, Exhibit 46.
22 And this is an e-mail Bates numbered
23 01641974 and is dated June 22nd, 2018.

24 (YouTube Beser Exhibit No. 46 was
25 marked for identification.)

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 490

1 an under 13 on YouTube, we take
2 immediate steps to remove that
3 account.

4 BY MS. SIEGEL:

5 Q. So, yes, YouTube is aware that
6 users under the age of 13 access YouTube main
7 without adult supervision?

8 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
9 form.

10 THE WITNESS: I -- I can't know
11 whether the adult is there or not.
12 YouTube cannot know if the adult is
13 there or not. When we learn of
14 unsupervised under-13 usage on
15 YouTube, we take immediate and
16 appropriate steps to remove that
17 account.

18 BY MS. SIEGEL:

19 Q. Is your testimony -- strike
20 that.

21 Do you believe that the
22 majority of under 13 -- let's introduce the
23 next exhibit.

24 Is one of the ways that -- that
25 underage users, meaning users under the age

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 491

1 of 13, access the user -- the YouTube
2 platform, by using a platform without logging
3 in?

4 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
5 form.

6 THE WITNESS: So, by
7 definition, we don't know much about
8 the user when they're using signed
9 out.

10 BY MS. SIEGEL:

11 Q. Is that a "yes"?

12 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
13 form, asked and answered.

14 THE WITNESS: I'm saying when a
15 user is signed out, there is less we
16 know about the user. So we don't
17 know.

18 BY MS. SIEGEL:

19 Q. And some of those users you
20 believe are under the age of 13?

21 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
22 form.

23 THE WITNESS: So YouTube signed
24 out is very easy to access, and it's
25 very likely that some of those users

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 492

1 are under 13. Whether they're being
2 supervised by a parent or not is
3 discouraged, and when we do learn that
4 an underage user is accessing YouTube
5 unsupervised, we take immediate and
6 appropriate action to terminate.

7 MS. SIEGEL: Let's enter the
8 next exhibit. Can you get for me
9 Bates number 01735688.

10 BY MS. SIEGEL:

11 Q. Before we enter that, you
12 mentioned earlier that when YouTube detects
13 an underage account, that they ask for age
14 verification. Is that correct? I may be
15 paraphrasing.

16 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
17 form, mischaracterizes the testimony.

18 THE WITNESS: Would you mind
19 repeating the question?

20 BY MS. SIEGEL:

21 Q. Sure. You mentioned earlier
22 that YouTube does have a process for
23 detecting U13 accounts; is that right?

24 A. We do. For instance, if we can
25 detect an under 13 or a probably -- or

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 493

1 probabilistically under 13 user in a video,
2 for instance, and we do not -- and there's
3 policy on this, right -- and we do not detect
4 or believe there is adult supervising, it
5 will go to an age verification flow.

6 Q. How -- strike that.

7 How does YouTube detect an
8 under 13 account? Is that by reviewing
9 videos?

10 A. So I have only surface level
11 knowledge of the process. [REDACTED]
12 [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
13 [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]. I
14 don't know all the things that go into that.

15 But then I do know that [REDACTED]
16 [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
17 [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
18 [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
19 [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
20 [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]
21 [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED] [REDACTED]

22 Q. Do you know if those signals
23 are limited to [REDACTED] [REDACTED]; in other words,
24 based on [REDACTED] versus what -- the
25 individual watches?

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 550

1 change."

2 Does that indicate that -- that
3 it was anticipated that under 13 users would
4 be identified and that that would have a
5 negative impact on other products?

6 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
7 form, foundation, mischaracterizes the
8 document.

9 THE WITNESS: The document --
10 all I know is what the document says.
11 It doesn't get into those details.

12 BY MS. SIEGEL:

13 Q. Sure. No problem. You can put
14 that aside.

15 A. Okay.

16 Q. We'll go to the next exhibit,
17 which is 1608369.

18 All right. We'll -- we'll skip
19 that one for now.

20 All right. Let's go to the
21 next exhibit which is tab 17, 1607593.

22 (YouTube Beser Exhibit No. 53 was
23 marked for identification.)

24 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

25 MS. WADHWANI: Mr. Beser needs

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 551

1 the exhibit copy.

2 MS. SIEGEL: Of course.

3 BY MS. SIEGEL:

4 Q. All right. This is an e-mail
5 from -- from yourself to a group of
6 individuals. And you can take a second and
7 read the e-mail. It's not that long.

8 A. (Peruses document.) Okay.

9 Q. Okay. And it looks like here
10 we are -- we are -- you guys were -- strike
11 that.

12 It looks like here there was a
13 discussion about how to promote Red to
14 YouTube Kids users; is that right?

15 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
16 form.

17 THE WITNESS: So I didn't read
18 every word, but from what I can tell,
19 it's trying to promote YouTube Red,
20 which is now YouTube Premium, which
21 was launching for the families -- to
22 the parents, who would be the ones to
23 actually purchase a premium
24 subscription.

25 BY MS. SIEGEL:

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 552

1 Q. Okay. And about three-quarters
2 down the page, there's an e-mail from [REDACTED]
3 [REDACTED], who says: "Why don't we target all
4 users who consume our kids content on YT?"
5 Right?

6 A. That's what it says.

7 Q. And then you respond that:
8 "Most of the technical capabilities exist."
9 Do you see that?

10 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
11 form, mischaracterizes the document.
12 Go ahead.

13 BY MS. SIEGEL:

14 Q. Oh, [REDACTED] [REDACTED].

15 A. Yeah, [REDACTED] [REDACTED] said that.

16 MS. WADHWANI: My prior
17 objection stands.

18 THE WITNESS: So I see [REDACTED]
19 [REDACTED] says that, yeah.

20 BY MS. SIEGEL:

21 Q. Okay. And so do you have
22 any -- any reason to dispute [REDACTED] [REDACTED]'s
23 statement that most of the technical
24 capabilities exist to target users who
25 consume kids content?

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 553

1 A. I'm sorry. I'm just reading it
2 a little -- I don't really know what he
3 means. It's a little word salad.

4 Q. Do you know if one of the
5 reasons that YouTube has avoided using its
6 age inference models to detect users under 13
7 is to avoid potential COPPA penalties?

8 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
9 form, foundation, argumentative.

10 THE WITNESS: So that's sort of
11 unrelated to this document, actually.

12 BY MS. SIEGEL:

13 Q. Sure.

14 A. Okay. Age assurance is
15 technically challenging. Building age
16 inference models accurately is something
17 that's -- that has evolved a lot over time,
18 gotten a lot better.

19 The -- building that accurately
20 for under 18 is hard. Building for under 13
21 is thought to be very, very hard, and
22 unproven. I can't think of a successful
23 signal that has launched in the area of
24 inferring under 13s.

25 For instance, we know that

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 554

1 parents co-watch with their kids a lot. And
2 so are you -- you know, just because you
3 watch Peppa Pig doesn't mean that you're an
4 unsupervised child on YouTube. Right?

5 Q. Would YouTube know if a user
6 had watched Peppa Pig and a series of
7 other -- strike that.

8 What if a user's history was
9 exclusively Peppa Pig and had no other adult
10 content, would that indicate that the user
11 was more likely to be a child?

12 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
13 form.

14 THE WITNESS: I haven't looked
15 at that problem to know. It's very
16 hard to know, right, if they're using
17 a parent's device, if the parent just
18 isn't a YouTube user. There could be
19 lots of reasons that an all Peppa Pig
20 watched stream might still be the
21 parent account and be watched with the
22 parent.

23 BY MS. SIEGEL:

24 Q. Okay. Let's -- let's move on.
25 We're going to talk about now digital

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 675

1 A. I'm sorry, which bullet is
2 this?

3 Q. Number II -- well, it's Roman
4 numeral II.

5 A. It's number II? I see. "Asks
6 that go beyond what is required by U.S. law."
7 Yes.

8 Q. Does YouTube only respond to --
9 sorry, strike that.

10 Is YouTube's aim to be -- to do
11 no better than what is required by law?

12 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
13 form.

14 THE WITNESS: Absolutely not.
15 We are very user focused in how we
16 approach the area of families, and the
17 YouTube Kids app is obviously under
18 that remit.

19 In fact, if you go to
20 Crosswalk, which we talked about
21 earlier, that was narrowly focused on
22 children's privacy and data usage, but
23 in fact, in our response to that, we
24 went further and not only
25 depersonalized ads for Crosswalk or

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 676

1 "made for kids" videos, but also made
2 a lot of investment, and continue to,
3 in the areas of safety and quality to
4 the recommendations.

5 So we are incredibly and very
6 proudly user first and principled in
7 our approach. And this is a document
8 specifically addressing a letter from
9 lawmakers, and therefore, I believe
10 that is why they are focused on U.S.
11 law in this document.

12 BY MS. SIEGEL:

13 Q. Is that why YouTube determined
14 to turn default protective measures on for
15 all -- all 18 users, whether inferred or
16 declared in the U -- in the EU where it was
17 required, but not in the U.S. where it was
18 not required?

19 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to
20 form, foundation.

21 THE WITNESS: I do not believe
22 that is accurate. You're referring to
23 our response to AADC in the European
24 union where we did a number of changes
25 to our default settings. At the same

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 677

1 time we rolled out many of those
2 changes to global-declared teens as
3 well.

4 BY MS. SIEGEL:

5 Q. Right. But for global-declared
6 teens, the defaults were rolled out only for
7 declared 18. Correct?

8 A. When we know that it's a teen,
9 we intervene.

10 Q. And in the EU, those default
11 measures are applied to users who are either
12 declared or inferred 18. Is that correct?

13 A. That is correct. In the EU,
14 they had a specific law that, you know,
15 inferred teen --

16 First, let me talk about that.
17 That is a probabilistic assertion of a user.
18 It is not known that they are a teen. And it
19 was a law -- obviously, we will be compliant
20 with the law in the regions where we operate,
21 and therefore we made that change.

22 But age assurance was early and
23 the signal quality has improved a lot. It
24 wasn't something that we felt comfortable
25 rolling out in other markets. There's a lot

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 678

1 that goes into that.

2 So, you know, there's a lot of
3 downsides to doing age inference. Again,
4 it's a probabilistic signal. It gets it
5 wrong a lot. So it could be very disruptive
6 for, for instance parents, who are
7 co-watching with their kids. If we get it
8 wrong, it would be very annoying for a parent
9 to suddenly have their Android device
10 disabled because their kid was using their
11 phone. Right.

12 So there are tradeoffs, and the
13 technology was early, right. And so, you
14 know, we've been -- it was something we had
15 to do to adhere to the law, but the
16 technology was very early and made a lot of
17 mistakes. Stuff like that is reasons that
18 went into the decision to restrict to
19 declared teens globally.

20 Q. When you say that their Android
21 device would be disabled, I thought that the
22 digital wellbeing tools were things like
23 turning off autoplay, turning on digital
24 wellbeing reminders.

25 Is there a part of the AADC

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 679

1 that would automatically turn off or disable
2 an Android phone?

3 A. Well, it's not a direct -- it's
4 not about the law. It's about the
5 implementation of inference. It is a
6 probabilistic signal. It is not perfect, and
7 it wasn't -- was more imperfect at the time.

8 You can see that in the
9 numbers. You know, I don't recall exactly
10 what they were, but it made a lot of
11 mistakes, and there's downsides to those
12 mistakes that are very disruptive for users.
13 Of course, you know, it's up to lawmakers to
14 create laws however they see fit for their,
15 you know, constituencies, and if they made it
16 a law, then those downsides for users aren't
17 really our choice.

18 Q. Have they made it -- strike
19 that.

20 YouTube recently announced that
21 it was expanding its -- strike that.

22 YouTube recently announced that
23 it would use age inference globally,
24 including in the United States, for things
25 like digital wellbeing features being turned

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 680

1 on by default. True?

2 A. I believe what we said was that
3 we are looking to expand age inference to the
4 U.S. The technology has improved a lot.
5 Things like ChatGBT, like these machine
6 learning systems have gotten a lot more
7 sophisticated. Right. You can do a lot more
8 today. I think everyone who's used, you
9 know, an LLM can sort of see that in
10 practice.

11 And what we announced was that
12 we believe the -- well, we didn't say it this
13 way. But, you know, the signal is now ready
14 for rollout in the broader set of places,
15 such as in the U.S. I do not believe that we
16 have said specifically what we would do once
17 we infer a teen outside of the European
18 Union.

19 Q. I appreciate that
20 clarification.

21 At the time or recently, has
22 there been legislation proposed in the United
23 States requiring YouTube to use an inferred
24 age?

25 MS. WADHWANI: Objection to

HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL

Page 816

CERTIFICATE OF CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER

The undersigned Certified Shorthand Reporter
does hereby certify:

That the foregoing proceeding was taken before
me at the place and time therein set forth, at
which time the witness was duly sworn; That the
testimony of the witness and all objections made
at the time of the examination were recorded
stenographically by me and were thereafter
transcribed, said transcript being a true and
correct copy of my shorthand notes thereof; That
the dismantling of the original transcript will
void the reporter's certificate.

In witness thereof, I have subscribed my name
this date: April 6, 2025.

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Leslie Anne Todd". The signature is written in a cursive style and is positioned above a horizontal line.

LESLIE A. TODD, CSR, RPR
Certificate No. 5129

(The foregoing certification of
this transcript does not apply to any
reproduction of the same by any means,
unless under the direct control and/or
supervision of the certifying reporter.)